

Minutes of 54th Annual Fellows' Forum (including AGM) of Royal Society of New Zealand (Te Apārangi)

The meeting held on Thursday, 13 February 2020 at Royal Society Te Apārangi began at 11 am.

Present: Professor P. Barnes; Dr K. Berryman; Professor R. Blaikie (Chair of the Academy Executive Committee); Professor P. M. Black; Dr I. W. M. Brown; Dr R. D. Burdon; Professor G. Chase; Professor M. Clout; Dr A. Conner; Professor J. Cornish; Professor C. Crowther; Professor N. Curtis; Professor Nicola Dalbeth; Dr F. J. Davey; Professor V. Feigin; Professor L. Ferguson; Professor I. Ferguson; Professor R. Ferguson; Professor R. Fischer; Dr S. R. Fischer; Professor G. Fletcher; Dr S. Goldson; Professor M. Gott; Professor J. Harding; Professor J. Harper; Professor B. Hokowhitu; Professor N. K. Kasabov; Professor W. Lerner; Professor C. Macdonald; Professor A. Macfarlane; Associate Professor S. Marsh; Professor G. Martin; Professor S. May; Professor R. Millane; Professor T. Mulgan; Professor R. Newnham; Professor D. Paterson; Professor E. Reese; Professor I. Reid; Professor S. Robertson; Dr M. Sagar; Professor D. B. Scott; Professor P. Seddon; Dr L. Wallace; Dr G. J. Weir; Professor D. V. Williams; Professor C. Wilson

In attendance: Dr Andrew Cleland, Chief Executive; and Gill Sutherland, Director—Academy Operations

Apologies: Professor C. R. W. Beasley; Professor R. Bedford; Professor D. Bridges; Professor M. Conder; Dr S. Corson; Professor R. Ferguson; Professor D. Lowe; Professor L. Oxley; Professor R. Poole; Professor K. Trenberth; Dr R. Franich; Professor H. Hayne; Professor D. Skegg; Professor D. Schiel.

1. Welcome

Professor Blaikie welcomed all Fellows to the Forum, and this was followed by a waiata sung by the collective group. He asked for any apologies already not received and advised that apologies for the meeting would be collated and included in the Minutes of the meeting.

2. Valedictories

Professor Blaikie announced the deaths since the last Annual Forum of the following Fellows and Honorary Fellows:

- Dr **George Grindley** FRSNZ, formerly of New Zealand Geological Survey, died on 2 February;
- Professor **Brian Halton** FRSNZ, formerly of Victoria University of Wellington, died on 23 February;
- Dr **David Kear** FRSNZ, formerly of DSIR, died on 5 March;
- Professor **Warren Moran** FRSNZ, formerly of the University of Auckland, died on 13 August 2019;
- Dr **Lawrie Creamer** FRSNZ, formerly of the Dairy Research Institute, died on 7 September 2019;
- Professor **Ken Strongman** FRSNZ, formerly of the University of Canterbury, died on 29 December.
- Dr **Diana Martin**, formerly of ESR, died on 31 December.

Obituaries have been, or will be lodged on the Royal Society website as they are provided.

He also mentioned the death of Hon Mike Moore who had died the previous week.

There was a one-minute silence in honour of the deceased persons.

3. Minutes of the 53rd Annual General Meeting held on 14 February 2019

The Minutes were taken as a true and correct record and CONFIRMED.

4. Matters arising

There were no Matters Arising.

5. Fellowship

5.1 Issues relating to 2019 Fellowship

Professor Blaikie made some general comments about the 2019 Fellowship election process. He mentioned that there was a period of change in the way disciplinary panels are constructed and operate with the reduction to six panels each in a broad domain, and enlargement of those panels. For the first time representatives from the Australian academies were invited onto the final Fellowship Selection Committee, with one in each of five of the six domains. They provided valuable input into the selection process so this practice will be employed again in 2020. Blind voting continues to be used at the final Fellowship Selection Committee.

6. Annual Report of Academy and Remarks from Chair of Academy

The Academy celebrated the centenary of the Fellowship in early 2019 with the induction of 20 new Fellows at a ceremony held in Wellington on 14 February, followed by the New Fellows' Symposium. The diversity and range of scholarship in the academy was significantly enhanced with these new elections, which included 11 women, 2 outstanding Māori scholars and one Fellow internationally recognised for original thinking and influence on the application of the Treaty of Waitangi in our law and society. In addition, three new Honorary Fellows were inducted at the ceremony.

All three Honorary Fellows joined the new Fellows and friends of the Academy at a special dinner that evening. Our special guest, Dame Anne Glover, President of the Royal Society Edinburgh, gave the after-dinner address. To recognise the Academy's centenary a cake was cut at the dinner by the oldest living Fellow Dr Eddie Robertson OBE CBE FRSNZ who had turned 100 in January.

The following day, 14 February, Dame Anne Glover contributed alongside a number of other distinguished speakers to a hui on how we might better recognise many and diverse forms of excellence in science, technology, the humanities and mātauranga as we strive to expand the scope and relevance of the Society and Academy to all New Zealanders.

Six people were awarded status as Companions of Royal Society Te Apārangi in 2019 and they were inducted at a ceremony in Wellington on 30 July coinciding with Professor Lerner's Presidential Address. Tā Tipene O'Regan was honoured by election as a Companion announced at the Research Honours Aotearoa celebration in Ōtepoti Dunedin, Te Waipounamu, in October.

The election of Fellows and Companions for induction in 2020 was also completed, with the Fellowship Selection Committee recommending the appointment of 18 new Fellows and 1 new Honorary Fellow.

Changes to the criteria for election to Companionship progressed through the Academy Executive Committee and Council in 2019, to recognise leadership in *knowledge holding* as a vital part of our research environment, and also to acknowledge the importance of mātauranga and indigenous knowledge in Aotearoa.

One of the highlights of the 2019 calendar was Research Honours Aotearoa, held at the Dunedin Town Hall in October. The scale and prestige of the event and the awards was again outstanding. One new Royal Society Te Apārangi award was presented for the first time, the Te Rangaunua Hiranga Māori Award to

recognise co-created research conducted by Māori, and a new award celebrating excellence in invention and creation was announced, supported by Callaghan Innovation, named Tahunui-a-Rangi which translates as “Great Glowing of the Sky”.

Academy-related activities also included contributing to the work of the Society’s *Expert Advice and Practice* programme, with the ongoing and extensive work of the gene editing Deliberative Panel and the production of *Fact Sheets* on medical cannabis and plastics.

The change in structure of the Academy Executive Committee to six Domain Convenors from three Vice-Presidents has proven successful. This structure and the effectiveness of our operation as a broad academy was reinforced during a visit to a number of the separate academies in Australia early in the year, where a separate Council (ACOLA – the Australian Council of Learned Academies) is required to foster the interdisciplinary cooperation we gain naturally in our inclusive Academy.

Dr Cleland was praised for his work in facilitating the Society’s admission to membership of the International Council of Academies of Engineering and Technology (CAETS), even though we are a multi-disciplined Academy.

Professor Blaikie thanked the staff of Royal Society Te Apārangi for the wisdom, knowledge and hard-working dedication they bring to the advancement of the Society’s objectives, and particularly to Gill Sutherland, Director – Academy Operation, who is retiring from the Society at the end of February. There was acclamation from the floor for her dedicated work for the Academy.

The Annual Report was **noted**.

7. Report by the President

The President began by re-iterating three primary aims she had for the Society during her 3-year tenure:

- (i) To embrace diversity in its multiple dimensions.
- (i) To build on the relationship with the Māori research community, to enhance Māori research, Māori researchers and Matauranga Māori; and
- (ii) To engage with early and mid-career researchers by better understanding their needs and issues and partnering with them to address these.

Eighteen months into her Presidency she said that the first two objectives had advanced well with more to do, and she was looking forward to better engagement with Early Career Researchers in the last year of her presidency.

Professor Lerner included the following in her report:

- Te Apārangi’s successful admission to CAETS;
- Code of Behaviour developed for those working in Te Apārangi or Te Apārangi organised events;
- Language assessment of Fellowship documentation for unconscious bias;
- Work on building on multiple forms of research excellence;
- Presidential address addressing the need to think differently about excellence;
- Engagement with Te Ao Māori;
- TUIA 250 activities and publication of a special issue of the *Journal of the Royal Society of New Zealand* reflecting on diverse knowledge but future-focused;
- Building new relationships with Māori, e.g., with Tūranganui-a-Kiwa in Gisborne, the three wānanga;

- Rangi Matamua’s Matariki Lecture series embracing communities in New Zealand and Australia as part of the ambition to speak to communities beyond our cities;
- The production of excellent resources on gene editing, medicinal cannabis and plastics Expert Advice and Practice team;
- Te Apārangi has agreed to be involved in a cross-sectorial piece of work looking at the needs of the research workforce including ECRs. This will inform wider discussion about doctoral training etc.

Professor Lerner said she was very proud of Te Apārangi’s work already completed but acknowledged that there was much more to do.

8. Report by the Chief Executive

Dr Cleland highlighted the following in his report:

- Te Apārangi continues to look at ways others are doing things internationally so we can learn from them;
- The Academy is doing reasonably well at embracing diversity with respect to gender but compared to academies in other countries to date has had poor success in embracing researchers outside the university system;
- The Academy is now engaging with relevant international peak bodies, e.g., Union Academique Internationale (humanities), International Science Council (includes social sciences) and CAETS;
- There continues to be very slow progress with engagement with the Pacific—are there ways the Society can collaborate with people there which is helpful for them?
- The Academy is looking at ways to get nominations of people in industry with a reasonable chance of success in Fellowship election;
- Te Apārangi is starting to engage with Māori but needs to continue to address this. There are very few Māori Fellows;
- Dr Marc Rands will be the new face as the Academy Executive Officer to the Fellows from 1 March 2020.

9. General discussion

Following a request, Professor Blaikie clarified the various components of Fellowship selection and election and the role of the Academy Executive Panel.

There was discussion on the excellent evidence-based Expert Advice documentation produced but the constraint of resources including funding to do more of this. Dr Cleland explained that the current source of funding was primarily from a core grant provided by the Government. An increase in this had been sought but no increase had been approved to date. The Society is looking at ways of building reserves through a benevolent trust which may then be able to provide investment income to expand Society programmes. The Society is currently using reserves built up from rent of the building, and is looking at ways of better using the site. The role of Expert Advice is critical and a mechanism for expanding that is to be encouraged.

The work on TUIA 250 was acknowledge with the outcome that Tupaia is becoming as well known now as Cook. Also this has led to the Government mandating that New Zealand history in schools will be compulsory from 2021. Dr Cleland advised that the Society was working with the Ministry of Education to

identify essential knowledge in the New Zealand curriculum and the Ministry is looking to the Society to form an expert advisory group. Te Apārangi needs to be careful as it is not an advocacy organisation.

Professor Blaikie talked about the TUIA 250 commemorations, the engagement with Tūranganui-a-Kiwa and repatriation of Taonga in Gisborne, the Expression of Regret by the British High Commissioner, and the hikoi of some senior staff to Waitangi, 180 years since Te Tiriti was signed.

There was discussion around engagement with Early Career Researchers and how to use the capabilities of the Fellowship to help in this area. The President said there were some learnings from other academies such as setting up mentoring programmes.

Professor Scott mentioned the very successful Alexander van Humboldt symposia that are run with 50% of the participants being Early Career Researchers. Another example was the Australian Academy for the Humanities who ran a very successful symposium for ECRs last year.

Te Apārangi ECRs plan to run their own conference in August 2020. Part of the challenge is that ECRs are often pulled in too many directions. The aim of an ECR group is to be career-enhancing rather than career-limiting and the Society needs to know what would work for such a group at this time. There was no appetite for an ECR Academy or College of New Scholars as run by the Canadian Royal Society.

GNS has a successful young researcher network and caution was expressed that the young person needs to ask for inclusion in an ECR group, not have it imposed upon them.

There was brief discussion on the weight of university Fellows in the Academy and the question asked as to how more CRI nominations might be brought forward. Relevant criteria are crucial.

Professor Chase mentioned that there is a difference between having a good nominee and a nomination made strongly. It was noted that help can be requested from Dr Cleland in preparing a well written nomination.

One possible flaw of the current selection processes at Te Apārangi generally is that very little feedback is given to unsuccessful nominees. The question was asked whether it is possible to build in some feedback loop to give some effective feedback.

10. Other Business

There was no other business.

10. Vote of Thanks

Professor Blaikie thanked all those present for attending the meeting. He thanked staff of the Society who have supported the Academy in various ways during the past year and particularly Gill Sutherland for the work she had done for the Academy as its Executive Officer over 20 years. On behalf of those present he offered her best wishes for a wonderful retirement that fills all her hopes, dreams and ambitions. He invited all those present to join him in a social function at the end of the day at which he would lead further recognition of Gill's contribution.

The meeting finished at 12.30 pm, and was followed by lunch, induction of New Fellows (including presentation of Fellows' certificates and signing of the Fellows' register) and presentations at the New Fellows' Seminar.